

EMERGING NATURALISM





# EMERGING NATURALISM

## CONTEXTS AND NARRATIVES IN EUROPEAN SCULPTURE 1140–1220

EDITED BY  
GERARDO BOTO VARELA  
MARTA SERRANO COLL  
JOHN MCNEILL



BREPOLS

Front cover: The apostles (Peter, Paul, James and John) in the Pórtico de la Gloria.  
© Museo Catedral de Santiago. Denis E. F.

Back cover: Choir enclosure, Liebfrauenkirche, Halberstadt.

© 2020, Brepols Publishers n.v., Turnhout, Belgium.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

D/2020/0095/229

ISBN 978-2-503-57448-6

Printed in the EU on acid-free paper.

## CONTENTS

<i>Emerging Naturalism and a New Medieval Morphology</i> <i>Herbert L. KESSLER</i>	7
<b>I. SHAPING LATE ROMANESQUE SCULPTURE. BALANCE AND PERSPECTIVE</b>	
The Attainment of a Compelling Naturalism in Sculpture <i>c.</i> 1200 <i>Gerardo BOTO VARELA</i>	13
What is So-Called Late Romanesque Sculpture? <i>Xavier BARRAL I ALTET</i>	25
<b>II. LATE ROMANESQUE / EARLY GOTHIC SCULPTURE IN EUROPEAN CATHEDRALS (1140-1220)</b>	
The Role of Burgundy in the Development of the First Column-Statues <i>Marcello ANGHEBEN</i>	53
Late Romanesque Sculpture and the Cathedrals of South-Western France <i>Quitterie CAZES</i>	75
An Enigma Put Aside. The Origin and Interpretation of a Decontextualized Capital from Saint Trophime at Arles <i>Juan Antonio OLAÑETA</i>	87
Around and After 1200. Old and New Concepts of Monumental Sculpture in the German Territories of the Holy Roman Empire <i>Claudia RÜCKERT</i>	103
Sculpture and Liturgy: Monuments and Art Histories of Southern Italy ( <i>c.</i> 1150–1250 and Beyond) <i>Elisabetta SCIROCCO</i>	127
Old Testament Sacrifice and Thirteenth-Century Tithe: Cain and Abel in the Architectural Sculpture of the Holy Roman Empire <i>Stephanie LUTHER</i>	149
Late Romanesque Sculpture in England. How Far Can the Evidence Take Us? <i>John MCNEILL</i>	167
The Gothic Last Judgment Portal <i>c.</i> 1210. Visual Strategies and Communicative Function <i>Bruno BOERNER</i>	197
Aesthetics and the Imitation of Antiquity in Early Gothic Sculpture <i>Laurence TERRIER ALIFERIS</i>	213



## CONTENTS

### III. SCULPTURAL VISUALISATIONS IN THE CATHEDRALS OF THE IBERIAN KINGDOMS (1160-1220)

The Reception of Burgundian Models in the Second Half of the Twelfth Century and the Naturalist Redefinition of Romanesque Sculpture in Castile <i>Marta POZA YAGÜE</i>	239
Master Mateo and the Cathedral of Santiago at the End of the Twelfth Century <i>Ramón YZQUIERDO PEIRÓ</i>	263
Late Romanesque Sculpture in the Kingdoms of Leon and Castile: Continuity or Change? <i>José Luis HERNANDO GARRIDO &amp; Antonio LEDESMA</i>	295
Romanesque Sculpture in Portuguese Cathedrals: Models, Continuity and Adaptation <i>Carla VARELA FERNANDES &amp; Paulo ALMEIDA FERNANDES</i>	317
The Meaning of the Romanesque Sculpture in the Cámara Santa at the Cathedral of Oviedo <i>César GARCÍA DE CASTRO VALDÉS</i>	333
Images and Stories: The Transformation of Space in the Cathedrals of the Ebro Valley <i>Esther LOZANO LÓPEZ</i>	359
The Vault Corbels in the Cloister of Tarragona Cathedral: Shaping a New Pictorial Corporeality that Goes Beyond Late Romanesque <i>Gerardo BOTO VARELA &amp; Marta SERRANO COLL</i>	379
About the Authors	405
Index of Names	409
Index of Places	415
Colour Plates	425

# AESTHETICS AND THE IMITATION OF ANTIQUITY IN EARLY GOTHIC SCULPTURE

Laurence TERRIER ALIFERIS  
Université de Neuchâtel

## ABSTRACT

This article discusses the emergence of a style, known as the '1200 style', one of whose principal characteristics is the evocation of antique art. Examination of the stylistic evolution of early Gothic sculpture similarly reveals a concern for realistic representation in the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries. Sculptors, like goldsmiths, tried to create convincing figures whose proportions and anatomies are consistent with those found in nature. Related to the development of the 1200 style and its links with antique work, the objective of these sculptors was not Antiquity itself but an aesthetic of naturalism. The Latin and French texts of the same period make abundant use of the antique *topos* of the statue animated by the breath of life. The realistic tendencies of artistic production are here explained by a desire to give presence to divinity through sculpture with a powerful capacity for re-presentation.

Artistic production north of the Alps during the second half of the twelfth century is characterised by a style that has been described as transitional between Romanesque and Gothic. Indeed, it was strongly marked by a search for naturalism. Art between 1180 and 1230 was also referred to as classicizing, before a vaguer but more suitable label was adopted which recognized the heterogeneous nature of the models and their interpretation: the '1200 style'. If numerous studies in recent decades have tried to identify the antique and Byzantine sources exploited by artists,<sup>1</sup> the issues which underlie the emergence of a softened, elegant art – one which emphasizes graceful forms and aspires to a pronounced three-dimensionality – are yet to be fully explained. After determining the main artistic trends during the period under review and recalling the methods used to imitate antique works, I will highlight the literary recovery of the antique *topos* of the animation of the statue. This parallels a similar artistic process aimed at strengthening the divinity and saintly power of active presence – *re-presentation* – through monumental sculpture.

## *1140–1220: the stylistic development of the first Gothic sculpture*

Historiography places the beginning of so-called Gothic architecture and sculpture at Saint-Denis.<sup>2</sup> The reconstruction of the famous abbey church initiated by Suger crystallised a number of inventions that were influential in architecture and sculpture in the following decades and served as an important milestone in the history of art. One of the major innovations was the articulation of the western façade in three portals corresponding to the internal structure of the building and on which figurative sculpture unfolded. A central portal and two smaller side portals supported rich narrative relief scenes in fields that had been exploited from the end of the eleventh century, namely on the tympana, arches and lintels. The jambs, however, were formed of statue-columns representing characters of the Old Testament which supplemented in a typological way the iconographic scene of the upper parts of the portal.

Architectural sculpture expanded dramatically and evolved considerably during the



Fig. 1. Chartres Cathedral, west façade, south portal, lintel, c. 1145. © *Jean-Yves Cordier*.

second half of the twelfth century. This period corresponds to the stylistic current known as the '1200 style', characterised by a relationship with antique sculpture. Comparing the lower lintel of the right portal of the west façade of Chartres Cathedral with the tympanum of the left portal of the west façade of Sens Cathedral (Figs 1 and 2) is an excellent starting point for examining the sculptural trends of the period. The lintel of Chartres was constructed around 1145–55 by one of six workshops active on the carved decoration of the western façade: that of the Headmaster, according to the accepted name given by Vöge.<sup>3</sup> Four successive biblical episodes are represented: the Annunciation, Visitation, Nativity and Annunciation to the shepherds. The characters stand next to each other on a single plane and are carved into a large monolithic block. In the centre, the bed of the Child is placed on an altar with the Virgin's bed below. The characters are elongated and the modelling of the anatomies – such as hands and calves – is not pronounced. The clothes are composed of straight, parallel folds. The

technical ability of the sculptor failed to break the rigid rendering of the stone. Forty years later, between 1187 and 1193,<sup>4</sup> a sculptor working in Sens illustrated two main scenes from the life of St John the Baptist on the tympanum of the left portal of the west façade of the cathedral: the Baptism of Christ and the Beheading of John the Baptist with Salome presenting his head to Herod and Herodias at the centre of the register. Stylistically, the fabrics are fluid and elegantly reveal the anatomy, especially on the body of Salome. The characters have a convincing corporeality and the anatomies are strongly modelled. The naturalistic representation of the characters is perfectly accomplished thanks to the high plasticity of the volumes, visible, for example, on the calves of the executioner of the saint or the torso of Christ and would have been accentuated by polychromy. The characters are grouped on two levels, the pronounced gestures make the scene persuasive and the accentuated dynamism of the executioner grabbing the head of the saint to behead him knows no precedent in the history of medieval sculpture.



Fig. 2. Sens Cathedral, west façade, north portal (the Baptist portal), tympanum (detail), c. 1187–93.  
© Bildarchiv Foto Marburg.



Fig. 3. Reims Cathedral, west façade, north buttress, tympanum, Finding of the True Cross, c. 1250.  
© Laurence Terrier Aliferis.

A comparison of these two reliefs highlights the main directions in the evolution of sculpture during the third quarter of the twelfth century. Emphasis was placed on creating a convincing sense of presence in the characters, achieved by the modelling and rendering of anatomical details, by fluid fabrics that accentuate bodily contours and succeed one another in areas of taut fabric and areas of pleated fabric, and by the illusion of three-dimensionality through the deployment of architectural space, depth of field and the duplication of drawings. Thus, the sculpture is characterised by four main properties: three-dimensionality; attention to anatomical details and the modelling of anatomies; gestual dynamism and the associated flexibility with which the draperies are carved and the creation of an illusion that the fabrics are fine and supple.

In the course of two generations, these principles became established. Thus, by the middle of the thirteenth century, the mutation

of a rigid and schematised style into a living and naturalistic style was complete. On the tympanum of the northern buttress of the west façade of Reims Cathedral c. 1250 (Fig. 3), the Invention of the Cross is presented in a realistic way, with pronounced gestures and an expressive force hitherto unparalleled in medieval art. The use of antique models underlies the scene, in the carving of the sculpture, in the compositional handling, in the grouping of the figures at different heights, in the detail of the faces as well as in the dynamism of the characters. A comparison with the Arch of Constantine of Rome shows the similarities with antique reliefs (Fig. 4). However, during the Middle Ages, Reims itself retained high-quality Roman remains, including those visible on the four city gates.<sup>5</sup> The medieval references to the reliefs of the Mars, Ceres, Vesle and Bazée gates testify to their iconographic richness, and the surviving remains bear witness to their high aesthetic quality. From the twelfth century, sculpture

acquired a convincing power of representation that gave the illusion of a living presence, which was, it will be recalled, reinforced by polychromy and whose main characteristics call to mind Greco-Roman sculpture.

*Sculpture and Antiquity: the '1200 style'*

More than a trend, this naturalistic phenomenon can be seen in all media (painting, goldsmithery and sculpture) and internationally, since from the Germanic Empire it spread in the kingdom of France, in Spain, in the Anglo-Norman kingdom but also in the Byzantine world. In fact, Kitzinger noted in Byzantine painting a period marked by a relaxed style and an acute attention to the modelling of the figures.<sup>6</sup> The naturalistic trend in the so-called Palaiologan Renaissance, chronologically located between 1200 and 1260, echoed Western art and the so-called '1200 style'.<sup>7</sup> This one designates the trend with naturalistic tendencies whose relations with antique art were underlined from the nineteenth century.<sup>8</sup> Geographically and chronologically well defined, the '1200 style' concerns artistic production in Northern Europe between 1180 and 1230 and was perceived as an intermediate stylistic phase between the Romanesque and the Gothic.<sup>9</sup> Historiography has proposed a common denominator linking works with heterogeneous formulations: that is that all refer back to antique works.<sup>10</sup> It is well known and well recognized that antique works were appreciated and imitated throughout the Middle Ages, with greater intensity at certain times than at others. This is the case during the Carolingian and Ottonian eras, then again in the reign of Frederick II Hohenstaufen. The corollary is that works of such classicizing character in some cases passed for works of Antiquity or the Renaissance. This is the case with the Utrecht Psalter (820–30 or 845–55), the relief of the lion and the ram from Saint-Sernin at Toulouse (c. 1120) both considered antique during the modern era,<sup>11</sup> or the bust of Frederick II preserved in the castle of Barletta (c. 1240), which eminent specialists dated to the fifteenth century.<sup>12</sup> But it is really between 1160 and 1220 north of the Alps that we find a high concentration of works that misled modern



Fig. 4. Arche of Constantine, relief inside the big arcade, 315. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.

scholars. The Besançon museum holds a small bronze statuette representing the river of paradise wearing a chlamys and bearing an upturned vase, a direct allusion to an antique river god. In addition to iconography, the stylistic aspects refer to works of late Roman Antiquity. The graceful lines of the anatomy, the modelling of the bust and the fabric hugging the body are all elements that echo Antiquity, so much so that the work was considered an antique in the eighteenth century. As part of the collection of the antiques cabinet at the Abbey of Saint-Germain-des-Prés in Paris, it was included in the work of a Benedictine from the congregation of St Maur of 1739.<sup>13</sup> It is accompanied by an inscription designating it 'Pactole' and is surrounded by two statuettes of Isis and Rhodope. In fact, it was made around 1160 on the banks of the Meuse. Another example is an aquamanile, which, because of its bust shape referring to Antiquity, could not be medieval according to certain scholars of the nineteenth century.<sup>14</sup> Nevertheless, this object comes from Aachen and probably dates from 1210.<sup>15</sup> The same confusion prevailed about the foot of the candelabrum of Prague Cathedral (c. 1170), of which the craftsmanship greatly evokes antique art.<sup>16</sup> Between 1575 and 1706, the fountain of the abbey of Saint-Denis, because of representations of deities and Greco-Roman



Fig. 5. Reliquary of saint Berchaire of Montier-en-Der, lost. Photomontage made from the drawing of the early eighteenth century kept in Paris, BnF, MS latin 11919, fol. 285 and ivory tablets stored in Paris, Musée national du Moyen Âge and London, Victoria and Albert Museum. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.

heroes, was taken for an antique work until 1706 when Michel Félibien read the inscription attributing the donation of the fountain to an abbot named Hugues, thus confirming a dating of between 1186 and 1204.<sup>17</sup> The famous statues of the Virgin Mary and Elizabeth on the western façade of Reims Cathedral, carved around 1220, are so classicizing in their clothing, the features of their faces and their ‘contrapposto’ that during the nineteenth century they were thought to have dated from the French Renaissance.<sup>18</sup> The same error occurred again in the case of a fragment of a pilaster at Chartres, which was henceforth known to have come from the funerary monument of the abbot Arnoult and to have been realised between 1220 and 1225.<sup>19</sup>

The above six carved or gold-plated works were produced in a radius of about 200 kilometers north of the Alps between 1160 and 1220. And indeed, during these years, the art of northern Europe adopted extremely classicizing traits; with supple drapes moulding graceful bodies, increased attention was paid to the volumes of the anatomies and a desire to represent the space in which the characters evolve developed convincingly. From there, several researchers tried to find antique models

among the works of the 1200s and attempted to determine the methods and the reasons for this imitation of the works of the past while wishing to specify the location of these sources.<sup>20</sup>

The conscious imitation of the works of Antiquity juxtaposed with other sources (Byzantine in particular) for aesthetic purposes was a feature of the work of the goldsmith Nicholas of Verdun, who reproduced antique but also Byzantine models. One work in particular was absolutely fundamental: the ivory diptych of the Nicomachi and Symmachi. As noted by Claussen, these fourth-century Roman leaves had been preserved from the seventh century in the Abbey of Montier-en-Der between Verdun and Reims.<sup>21</sup> Thanks to their reproduction in 1717 by Dom Martène and Dom Durand, we know that the diptych was inserted into a reliquary dedicated to Saint Berchaire (Fig. 5), which was melted down during the French Revolution. In addition to the engraving, a fragment found in 2009 (an enamelled plate representing three angels holding banners on which *Sanctus* is inscribed)<sup>22</sup> allows us to specify when and where this reliquary was realised. In all likelihood, it was produced in around 1170 in a Mosan workshop. But again, the ornamental

decor of the reliquary strongly suggests an intervention by Nicholas of Verdun himself. The latter, influenced in a decisive way by the representations of the antique diptych – which he could meticulously examine during the assembling of the reliquary and by other antique works (the sarcophagus of Jovin and statues in bronze, among others) that he could admire in Reims, or in Cologne (busts in stone and bronze) – fashioned an extremely graceful style.<sup>23</sup> This is really the starting point of a process of observing antique works to imitate the ‘contrapposto’, the behaviour of the fabrics on the anatomy, the effects of three-dimensionality, the gestures and elegance of the forms, that developed in the following years (Fig. 6). The altarpiece at Klosterneuburg, signed by Nicholas of Verdun in 1181, is full of details directly indebted to antique art, as was the shrine of the Magi begun a few years later for the cathedral of Cologne.

It was mainly sculptors who quickly adopted the new aesthetic developed by the Mosan goldsmiths to create a graceful and naturalistic style, sometimes referring directly to antique works. According to my research, the impact of Nicholas of Verdun can already be found in the 1180s in sculpture. It is in Reims, in the abbey church of Saint-Remi that we find the first close links with the goldsmith.<sup>24</sup> The figures of the consoles of the nave display a style of supple draperies with long folds falling gracefully over the bodies. Moses, in particular, resembles Solomon’s figure on the later shrine of the Three Magi of Cologne in the 1190s (Figs 7 and 8). It is known that Nicholas of Verdun kept models or sketches in his studio<sup>25</sup> that were executed at the latest during the preparatory stage of the Klosterneuburg ambo in order to exploit them in his later works, and the link between Moses and Solomon could be due either to the presence of preparatory sketches in Reims or to a work by Nicholas of Verdun made in Reims. Indeed, several clues lead me to believe in the existence of a missing gold-plated work of high quality that was realised in this city by Nicholas of Verdun.<sup>26</sup> He certainly stayed there before leaving for Klosterneuburg around 1173–75. In the city, he was confronted by a number of clearly visible antique vestiges



Fig. 6. Nicholas of Verdun, altar, Klosterneuburg abbey, Queen of Sheba visiting King Solomon, 1181. © Stift Klosterneuburg. Peter Böttcher.

and was directly inspired. The witnesses of this work of observation and imitation of the antique works of Reims are attested to in the altarpiece of Klosterneuburg. Moreover, in addition to Saint-Remi, it is in Laon, situated about sixty kilometers to the north-west, that we find works stylistically related to the art of Nicholas of Verdun. If it has been suggested that the same sculptor was active on both sites,<sup>27</sup> variations in the processing of volumes and fabrics make it seem to me more likely that the relationship between the sculptures of these two sites comes from a common goldsmiths’ source. Here again, the extremely close relationship between Laon’s sculpture and Nicholas of Verdun’s ambo was emphasized, and prove particularly significant (Figs 9 and 10). The points of similarity are numerous: the positioning of the bodies with a slight bending of the knees, the body-garment relationship with areas of stretched fabric under which is revealed the perfectly modelled body, the syntax of folds articulated in the same way as folds in a bowl, rectilinear folds and some



Fig. 7. Reims, Saint-Remi, nave, corbel, Moses, *c.* 1180. © *Iliana Kasarska.*



Fig. 8. Nicholas of Verdun, Shrine of the Three Kings, Cologne Cathedral, Solomon, c. 1190. © Domhütte Köln. Reinhard Matz and Axel Schenk.



Fig. 9. Laon Cathedral, west façade, north portal, lintel, Annunciation, c. 1190, plaster, Paris, Musée des Monuments français. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.



Fig. 10. Nicholas of Verdun, altar, Klosterneuburg abbey, Annunciation, 1181. © Stift Klosterneuburg.

lighter folds on the legs. The sheer number of comparisons that can be suggested shows that the carved decoration of the west façade of the cathedral completed before 1190 can be, in many ways, seen as a transposition into the stone of the new dynamic style and the naturalistic setting put into place by the goldsmith Nicholas of Verdun.<sup>28</sup>

The boundaries between goldsmithery and sculpture were extremely porous, especially in the 1170s and 1180s. But if Nicholas of Verdun converged with antique works to develop his style and develop new forms, the same is not true of the sculptors responsible for Laon and St-Remi. It is, it seems to me, in Sens that a sculptor consciously referred to antique works, in an aesthetic perspective far removed from any ideological preoccupation. Considered one of the first manifestations of the '1200 style', the

sculpture of Sens is characterised by an elegance of forms, curvilinear reliefs, a strong plastic presence of figures, attention to anatomies and proportions, and fluid draperies. If the same stylistic concept unites Sens to Laon, the plastic translation differs probably as a result of direct contact between antique works and the sculptor. The Senonian style goes beyond Laon in the curve of the lines and their regularity, as well as in the sensuality of the anatomies.

Unlike the sculptor of Laon, the one of Sens (Pl. 11, Fig. 2) was directly marked by the antique works that he observed in the city, still imbued with a Roman heritage characterised by a Hellenic trend.<sup>29</sup> The medieval city, built on the Gallo-Roman site, was thus inserted into a pre-existing urban fabric and maintained traces of the earlier city, including the baths and the fortress.<sup>30</sup> The antique works



Fig. 11. Frieze from Sens thermae, Sens City Museum. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.

served the sculptor working in the 1180s and lay behind his attempts to smooth the forms, bring volume and strength of conviction to the characters and to shape elegant faces. Works such as a fragment of a frieze from the baths, or the relief of Ulysses and Calchas, both preserved in the municipal museum of Sens, may have been used by the sculptor for modelling the anatomies and the softness of the features of the faces (Figs 11 and 12).<sup>31</sup> Nevertheless, in general, the direct imitation of antique works, whether in goldsmiths' work or in sculpture, remains an occasional and specific phenomenon.

Thus, before the great constructions of the early thirteenth century, the imitation of antique work in sculpture seems to have been a sporadic phenomenon. And even when antique models can be detected, the examples are limited and chronologically constrained. If historiography has spoken of classicizing art, it is above all because of the naturalistic character that spanned the artistic production between the Klosterneuburg ambo (1181) and the group of the Visitation of Reims (around 1220), two works which were directly based on antique models. Antiquity was used by some artists as a means but not an end, a way of achieving more



Fig. 12. Relief of Ulysses and Calchas, Sens City Museum. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.

convincing representations. It is a keen sense of an accomplished aesthetic that guided artists and led some to the art of antique sculptors, who succeeded perfectly in rendering the illusion of life in stone statues. In general, the goal was not Antiquity for its imperial value, as was the case during the Ottonian or Carolingian periods, or under Frederick II Hohenstaufen. There is also no voluntary reference to a glorious past close to the birth of Christ as can be determined at the time of the Gregorian reform in Rome or in some Romanesque churches.<sup>32</sup>

The examination of all known sculptural production between 1150 and 1220 points to

the sporadic use of antique works. These were imitated, and always adapted, without any systematic character. By observing the mastery of the representation of 'contrapposto', it is possible to follow the methods of the imitation of Antiquity. The representation of this position of the body that was magnificently developed during Antiquity and then disappeared around the fifth century reappears in the Klosterneuburg ambo thanks to the observation by Nicholas of Verdun of Roman works present in and around Reims, like the diptych of the Nicomachi and Symmachi and a statuette of Mars from Reims.<sup>33</sup> In sculpture, the first attempts to



Fig. 13. Sens Cathedral, west façade, central portal, foolish virgin, c. 1193. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.



Fig. 14. Reims Cathedral, west façade, central portal, right jamb, Visitation, c. 1220. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.

represent a figure in ‘contrapposto’ can be seen at Sens Cathedral in the 1190s in a rather clumsy manner (Fig. 13).<sup>34</sup> A flexed leg moves away from the trunk of the body, but the supporting leg is flexed instead of stretched. To signify the counter-balancing of the shoulders, the whole bust is clumsily pulled back. These are the premises of the reappearance of ‘contrapposto’ in sculpture, which will reach its completion only with the group of the Visitation of Reims. The sculptor here grasped the stretched leg–flexed leg dichotomy as well as the counterbalancing movement of the body (Fig. 14). However, the feet remain parallel and within the axis of the

body, thus not quite respecting the antique principle based on natural body movement.

#### *Opus quam vivere credas*

Therefore, antique works were imitated not because of their reference to an imperial, glorious or even Christlike past (the moment of the birth of Christ), but for their aesthetic and naturalistic effect. It was not access to the antique repertoire that suddenly became easier, whether through trips to Rome or Greece or through books of models. It is a change in the way people saw the antique heritage available in the ancient cities of

the Roman provinces that led some sculptors to appropriate its formal characteristics. We have already noted elsewhere that the texts make it possible to understand the way in which the antique works were perceived during the Middle Ages, and we note a shift in attitude toward them from the middle of the twelfth century.<sup>35</sup> Indeed, the texts of the late eleventh century emphasize the expressiveness and technical prowess of antique achievements. When in 1070 a peasant unearthed a statue's head while ploughing his field near Meaux, he presented it to the Archdeacon Foulcoie de Beauvais. He described it as a formidable head that impressed with its frightening beauty and terrifying gaze.<sup>36</sup> Foulcoie showed an archaeological interest, since he tried to determine which deity represented the sculpture. His interest was marked by the strong expressiveness of the head to the point that for him it did not correspond to anything existing. The head was beautiful in the power of its hideous expression. At the same period, Sigebert de Gembloux, in Metz, described the aqueduct of his city. He praised this masterpiece with enthusiasm, he insisted on the perfection of the work carried out by the Romans and admired the fact that they had managed to master the natural elements. The technical prowess remained visible despite the damage caused over time.<sup>37</sup> In 1084, it was pieces of crockery that were the subject of commentary. Guibert, a monk at Oudenburg, near Bruges, described some vases and cups that were discovered in Cologne. They are, he wrote, beautiful vases, 'so ingeniously fashioned and sculptured, that skilful artists of our day would hardly be able to match the elegance of their work with gold and silver'.<sup>38</sup> At the end of the eleventh century, antique objects were perceived as objects or constructions admirable and resistant to time. The quality of the objects was praised and put forward as a technical feat that did not find its equal in contemporary achievements.

From the middle of the twelfth century, a slip occurred, an archaeological and technical consideration: it was now their resemblance to nature that forced the admiration of medieval clerics. Osbert de Clare, prior of Westminster Abbey, saw the Arch of Titus when he went to

Rome to ask the Pope for the canonisation of Edward the Confessor, founder of Westminster. The Triumphal Arch built by Emperor Domitian in the first century to commemorate his brother's victories attracted Osbert's attention in particular, who described sculptures that were almost living carved out of marble.<sup>39</sup> The Tarpian rock is a mound located at the southern end of Capitol Hill in Rome, actually overlooking the Arch of Titus. Osbert did not describe the scenes represented but he knew that the arch was consecrated to the Roman emperor. According to his story, the bas-reliefs were not altered by time and testified to the technical prowess of the antique sculptors. Above all, he saw representations that were 'almost alive'. It is this – the impression of vivacity – that appears in the middle of the twelfth century in descriptions of antique works. We find this emphasis on the naturalism of the antique representations in the very detailed text of another Englishman, writing around 1200. Master Gregory, probably a pilgrim who stayed in the holy city, specifically described the antique pagan remains he met. On two occasions, he showed great interest in the works he saw and averred their verisimilitude. They are so true to life; they are almost alive, he wrote. He first saw a bronze bull that was so well made that it seemed to roar and move on the ramparts of the Castel Sant'Angelo.<sup>40</sup> Later in his story, when he found himself in front of one of his favourite works, which filled him with the liveliest emotion, he was troubled by the realism, the faithful resemblance to nature. A naked Venus so enthralled him that he came back to see her three times. It was made 'in the marble of Paros with an art so admirable and inexplicable that it seems to be more a living creature than a statue'.<sup>41</sup> During the conquest of Constantinople in 1204, Robert de Clari was also seduced by two statues of women resembling real women.<sup>42</sup> Of course, we are dealing here with the antique revival of a literary *topos* based on the myth of Pygmalion, who fell in love with the statue he created, and on the myth of Daedalus, the first sculptor to have made statues so perfect that they seemed to move.<sup>43</sup> After a rich antique fortune, the rhetoric of the painted or sculpted representation as real as life seems to reappear

in the Middle Ages around 1100 under the pen of Baudri de Bourgeuil in his description of the tapestry adorning the room of the Countess Adèle. On five occasions, the poet emphasized the impression of movement and realism of representations that give the impression of being alive.<sup>44</sup> This poem was widely disseminated in Anglo-Norman milieu and it is indeed in the 'novels of Antiquity' and vernacular literature between 1160 and 1200 in French that the theme recurs.<sup>45</sup> It is also widely developed in the *Tristan and Iseut* of Thomas (around 1173), transmitted by the Scandinavian Saga.<sup>46</sup> Tristan erects a group of six statues in the centre of a vaulted room in the castle of the giant Moldagog, whom he defeated. Yseut, his dog, and his companion Brangien are represented, as well as the giant and a lion. The statues look lively, animated. Tristan speaks to them and kisses the statue of Yseut, transferring his love for his beloved to a copy of stone. Statues as alive as nature are described in *Le Roman de Partonopeu de Blois* (between 1150 and 1188)<sup>47</sup> and in *Le Roman de Troie* (c. 1165),<sup>48</sup> while paintings are similarly treated in *Le Roman d'Alexandre* (c. 1180).<sup>49</sup> These novels take up the subject matter of antique stories; they are conceived as rewritings of the great stories of Greco-Roman Antiquity adapted in the vernacular. These also contain rhetorical elements or antique themes, including statues or paintings so well done that one would believe them to be alive. The very origin of the French novel was developed on the basis of antique epics and arises parallel to the artistic development of a classicizing style in an extremely favourable general context that has been described by historians as the Twelfth-Century Renaissance, and whose area of expression is located north of the Alps, both in the kingdom of France, in the Germanic empire and in the Anglo-Norman world.<sup>50</sup> A movement beyond this fertile link with the antique past was particularly sensitive to the illusion of liveliness provided by figurative representations. And if the textual references to living statues have been studied for Antiquity and the modern period, it still remains to be done for the Middle Ages.<sup>51</sup>

For some decades, in Western society, the expression 'a statue truer than nature' evokes

the wax statues of the Grévin Museum. In the French-speaking world, the media use it extensively to designate these incredible creations, whose aim it is to make present the historical or emblematic personalities of our time. They have a value of 're-presentation'. In my opinion, the function of the monumental statues on the portals of the religious buildings of the second half of the twelfth century was certainly comparable: to exercise a presence in the sensible world and to give the illusion of life. Mediators between the terrestrial world and the divine, their communicative power was reinforced by their resemblance to the sensible world.

*The 'ronde-bosse': Gothic revolution and antique appropriation*

This force of representation of the architectural statue reached its full culmination in the middle of the thirteenth century. The late sculpture of Reims Cathedral (around 1250) or the portal of the north porch of Bordeaux Cathedral (around 1250), before the impressive portals of the western façade of Strasbourg (around 1280), represent the full manifestation of the experiments carried out during previous decades. To affirm the presence of the divine world at the doors of the building and increase the *enargeai* (living presence) of the saint, a fundamental step was taken around 1220 when the architectural statue became the 'ronde-bosse'. The first stage of this revolution took place in Strasbourg on the basis of the imitation of antique works.<sup>52</sup> Since the 1140s and the construction site of Saint-Denis, monumental statuary was intrinsically linked to architecture as the column-figures supported the jambs of the portals.

Although it existed in Antiquity, the column-statue possessed the characteristic of being completely joined to the wall, thus obstructing the rear of the column. The sculptors had to find ways to reconcile the horizontality of the statues' feet with the verticality of the column's shaft in a manner that was convincing. An intermediate element then came to unite the shaft with the foot of the statue, in the form of a mound or marmoset. The latter had the



Fig. 15. Strasbourg Cathedral, South transept portal, c. 1215–20. © Laurence Terrier Aliferis.

advantage of allowing for the positioning of the feet while providing additional information on the function of the statue (marmoset-demoniac crushed by the saint) or on the identity of the personage represented (marmouset-attribute). From the portals of Chartres (around 1145), a micro-architectural canopy came to overhang the statues. This canopy, which became a permanent feature of the monumental statue in the 1220s, through its micro-architectural form and its direct reference to the materiality of the stone has a counterbalancing effect. Indeed, the hierarchy of materials is abundantly described in the literature of the twelfth century: ivory and gold surpass stone.<sup>53</sup> Little valued, stone must give the illusion of other materials by using polychrome, the fineness of the details and other peripheral elements. The technical ability of the sculptor must be able to mask the material in addition to the polychromy. Thus, the addition of a micro-architectural canopy, which, with its explicit reference to stone diminishes the materiality of the statue, contributes to the reinforcement of the visual illusion. These canopies developed independently of any reference to Antiquity. On the other hand,



Fig. 16. Sosikles, Wounded Amazon, Rome, Capitoline Museums, reverse shot. © 2006, Scala, Florence / Art Resource, N. Y.



Fig. 17. Personification of *Synagoga*, from the south transept portal of the Strasbourg Cathedral, Musée de l'Oeuvre Notre-Dame, c. 1220, detail of the face and of the clothes. Left. © Musées de Strasbourg. *Matthiew Bertola*. Right. *Laurence Terrier Aliferis*

the master sculptor who probably came from Chartres as early as 1215 to work on the south portal of Strasbourg Cathedral made the first 'ronde-bosse' for a monumental statue intended to adorn an architectural wall, not on the jambs, but on the rib of the portal. *Ecclesia and Synagoga* (Fig. 15), although intended to be placed in front of the wall, were not designed to be observed on all sides, but their autonomy vis-à-vis the architecture and their freedom of movement are unprecedented for the Middle Ages. The relationship to the wall remained unchanged; it was the aesthetic effect produced by the sculpture that ensured the success of this re-appropriated technique. The return to 'ronde-bosse' makes it possible to effectively heighten the sense of actual presence and to increase the dynamic capacities of the sculpture in ways which are impossible when it is attached to the column. I have shown elsewhere how the Strasbourg sculptor meticulously observed antique sculpture, which he probably found nearby, in order to achieve a convincing dynamic effect.<sup>54</sup> The twisting movement of the *Synagoga*

is reminiscent of many antique statues (Fig. 16), as are the draperies so skilfully and finely carved that one forgets they are made of stone (Fig. 17). It was at the portals of Bourges, a few years later, that statues in 'ronde-bosse' were adopted in the jambs rather than column-statues. They disappeared quickly and definitively.<sup>55</sup> If the size of a statue in 'ronde-bosse' resulted from the observation of monumental antique 'rondes-bosses', the impulse was motivated more by a desire to make statues convincing in their strength of presence than by a desire to refer to the Roman past.

From the middle of the twelfth century, the technical effort of sculptors was therefore directed towards creating naturalistic representations close to the sensible world and away from the schematised forms of the Romanesque era. Due to the increased attention given to the modelling of bodies, the soft and graceful fall of fabric over the anatomy and the effects of three-dimensionality, production north of the Alps between 1180 and 1230 is often described as classicizing. Indeed, some

goldsmiths – initially Nicholas of Verdun – and some sculptors – in Sens, then Strasbourg and Reims among other centres – observed antique art as a means of arriving at realistic representations and of varying the faces of the characters represented. Although sporadic, the imitation of statuettes, sarcophagi or bas-reliefs, still visible in the cities of the ancient Roman provinces in Gaul and Germany, was useful in developing a naturalistic aesthetic. This new stylistic trend spread widely over two generations. Reading the texts of the twelfth century highlights the reappearance of an

antique literary *topos* praising the vital breath of statues, which are described as true to life. If it is indeed the resurgence of a literary motif, this intervenes at the very moment when medieval sculpture acquires naturalistic effects otherwise unused since the end of Antiquity. This could be related to the need to affirm the presence of the divine in the terrestrial world as a means of access to God for the faithful. Indeed, a decisive turning point occurred around 1220 when the monumental statues of jambs became ‘rondes-bosses’ and acquired a force of presence, of ‘representation’, unheard of until then.

## Notes

- \* This text has been translated by Sophie Edgley.
- 1 See bibliography in Laurence TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*, Turnhout, 2016.
  - 2 From Wilhelm VÖGE, *Die Anfänge des Monumentales Stiles im Mittelalter*, Strasbourg, 1894; see recently Alain ERLANDE-BRANDENBURG, *La révolution gothique*, Paris, 2012.
  - 3 The date 1145–55 for the realisation of the three portals was unanimously accepted following Marcel AUBERT, 'The Royal Portal and the Western Façade of the Cathedral of Chartres', in *Bulletin monumental*, 100, 1941, pp. 177–218. Wilhelm VÖGE proposed the simultaneous intervention of four sculptors in the realisation of the three portals of the western façade of the Chartres Cathedral: VÖGE, *Die Anfänge des Monumentales Stiles*, p. 135 *et seq.* Stoddard refined the distinction of the different hands at work and rightly identified six: Whitney S. STODDARD, *The West Portals of Saint-Denis and Chartres: Sculpture in the Ile-de-France from 1140 to 1190. Theory of Origins*, Cambridge Mass., 1952.
  - 4 According to the date proposed by Irene PLEIN, *Die frühgotische Skulptur an der Westfassade der Kathedrale von Sens*, Münster, 2005.
  - 5 TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*, p. 66.
  - 6 Ernst KITZINGER, 'The Bizantine Contribution to Western Art of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries', in *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, 20, 1966, pp. 25–47.
  - 7 For a summary overview of the period, see John LOWDEN, *Early Christian and Byzantine Art*, London, 1997, pp. 307–424.
  - 8 By Nicholas of Verdun in particular. See Albert CAMESINA and Joseph ARNETH, *Das Niello-Antependium zu Klosterneuburg in Österreich, gefertigt im zwölften Jahrhundert von Nikolaus aus Verdun*, Vienne, 1844, p. 6; Carl SCHNAASE, *Geschichte der bildenden Kunst im Mittelalter. Entstehung und Ausbildung des gotischen Styles*, Düsseldorf, 1872, p. 621.
  - 9 Louis GRODECKI, 'Style 1200', in *Encyclopaedia Universalis, Supplément II*, 1980, pp. 1337–40, reedited in *Le Moyen Age retrouvé*, 1, Paris, 1985, pp. 385–98.
  - 10 Since Otto HOMBURGER, 'Zur Stilbestimmung der figürlichen Kunst Deutschlands und des Westlichen Europas im Zeitraum zwischen 1190 und 1250', in *Formositas Romanica. Beiträge zur Erforschung der Romanischen Kunst. Joseph Gantner zugeeignet*, Frauenfeld, 1958, pp. 29–45.
  - 11 Paul DURRIEU, 'L'origine du manuscrit célèbre dit le *Psautier d'Utrecht*', in *Mélanges Julien Havet*, [1895], Geneva, 1972, pp. 639–57; Daniel CAZES and Quitterie CAZES, *Saint-Sernin de Toulouse, de Saturnin au chef-d'œuvre de l'art roman*, Graulhet, 2008, pp. 286–89.
  - 12 Helmut BUSCHHAUSEN, 'Das Altersbildnis Kaiser Friedrichs II', in *Jahrbuch der Kunsthistorischen Sammlungen*, 70, 1974, pp. 28–38; Willibald SAUERLÄNDER, 'L'époque des Hohenstaufen', in *Revue de l'Art*, 39, 1978, p. 70; for further reading see Maylis BAYLÉ, 'L'évocation de l'Antiquité dans l'art de l'Italie méridionale au temps de Frédéric II', in *Frédéric II (1194–1250) et l'héritage normand de Sicile*, Anne-Marie FLAMBARD HÉRICHER (ed.), Caen, 2017, pp. 131–46.
  - 13 R. P. Dom MARTIN, *Explication de divers monumens singuliers qui ont rapport à la religion des plus anciens peuples*, Paris, 1739, p. 319, pl. X. On this subject, see *Une renaissance. L'art entre Flandre et Champagne, 1150–1250*, exhibition catalogue, Christine DESCATOIRE and Marc GIL (ed.), Paris, 2009, cat. 12, p. 74.
  - 14 Adolphe Napoléon DIDRON, *Manuel des œuvres de bronze et d'orfèvrerie du Moyen Âge*, Paris, 1859, p. 157.
  - 15 The bust-shaped aquamanile has received little in-depth study. See in particular the record in *The Year 1200. A Centennial Exhibition at The Metropolitan Museum of Art*, Konrad HOFFMANN (ed.), New York, 1970, cat. 124, p. 118.
  - 16 Peter Cornelius CLAUSSEN, 'Zum Stil der Plastik am Dreikönigenschrein. Rezeptionen und Reflexionen', in *Kölner Domblatt*, 42, 1977, pp. 7–42.
  - 17 Laurence TERRIER ALIFERIS, 'La fontaine du cloître de l'abbatiale de Saint-Denis: programme iconographique et contexte de création', in *Revue de l'Art*, 191, 2016, pp. 27–39.
  - 18 Erwin PANOFSKY, *Renaissance and renaissances in western art*, Stockholm, 1965, p. 63.
  - 19 Willibald SAUERLÄNDER, 'Art antique et sculpture autour de 1200. Saint-Denis, Lisieux, Chartres', in *Art de France*, I, 1961, pp. 47–56.
  - 20 The bibliography is extensive; among the key studies the work of Richard HAMANN-MACLEAN, 'Antikenstudium in der Kunst des Mittelalters', in *Marburger Jahrbuch für Kunstwissenschaft*, 15, 1949/50, pp. 157–250 should be retained; Richard HAMANN-MACLEAN, 'Byzantinisches und spätantikes in der Werkstatt des Nikolaus von Verdun', in *Kölner Domblatt*, XXXXII, 1977, pp. 243–66; Hermann FILLITZ, 'Zu Nikolaus von Verdun. Die Frage seiner antiken Anregungen', in *Rhein und Maas. Kunst und Kultur 800–1400*, exhibition catalogue, Cologne-Brussels, 1972, pp. 279–82; Peter Cornelius CLAUSSEN, 'Antike und gotische Skulptur in Frankreich um 1200', in *Wälfrat-Richartz-Jahrbuch*, 35, 1973, pp. 83–108; CLAUSSEN, 'Zum Stil der Plastik am Dreikönigenschrein. Rezeptionen und Reflexionen', pp. 7–42; Peter Cornelius CLAUSSEN, 'Nikolaus von Verdun. Über Antiken- und Naturstudium an Dreikönigenschrein', in *Ornamenta Ecclesiae. Kunst und Künstler der Romanik*, exhibition catalogue, 2, Cologne, 1985, pp. 447–56; Peter Cornelius CLAUSSEN, 'Antikisierende Kleinplastik im Vorfeld und Umkreis des Nikolaus von Verdun', in *Römische Historische Mitteilungen*, vol. 41, 1999, pp. 95–116, 243–66; Samuel VITALI, 'Sicut explorator et spoliolum cupidus: Zur Methode und Funktion der Antikenrezeption bei Nicolaus von Verdun', in *Wiener Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte*, 2002, pp. 9–47, 161–76; Fabienne JOUBERT, *La sculpture gothique en France*, Paris, 2008; and TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*.
  - 21 Peter Cornelius CLAUSSEN, 'Das Reliquiar von Montier-en-Der. Ein spätantikes Kiptychon und sein mittelalterliche Fassung', *Pantheon*, 36, 1978, pp. 308–19.
  - 22 Reported and reproduced by Philippe GEORGE, 'Entre pays mosan et Champagne. Le trésor des reliques de Montier-en-Der', in *Cahiers archéologiques. Fin de l'Antiquité et moyen âge*, 53, 2011, pp. 63–88. The

- discovery of the plate, mentioned by Paul WILLIAMSON, *Victoria and Albert Museum. Medieval Ivory Carvings. Early Christian to Romanesque*, London, 2010, p. 35, is due to the art expert Richard Camber. See also Laurence TERRIER ALIFERIS 'Nicolas de Verdun à Reims: diffusion de l'art mosan et développement du style 1200', in *Bulletins des Musées royaux d'Art et d'Histoire*, special issue, *L'art mosan (1000–1250). Un art entre Sein et Rhin*, Sophie BALACE, Mathieu PIAVAUX, Benoît VAN DEN BOSSCHE (ed.), in press.
- 23 TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*, pp. 51–74.
- 24 Dated to the 1180s by Willibald SAUERLÄNDER, *Gotische Skulptur in Frankreich: 1140–1270*, Munich, Hirmer, 1970; about 1190 according to Anne PRACHE, *Saint-Remi de Reims, L'œuvre de Pierre de Celle et sa place dans l'architecture gothique*, Geneva, 1978. The dating obtained by the latter is done by comparison with the carvings of the central door of the façade of the Laon Cathedral, that dates towards 1190. Saint-Remi would follow Laon, so shortly after 1190. Now, according to the results of Iliana KASARSKA, *La sculpture de la façade de la cathédrale de Laon. Eschatologie et humanisme*, 2008, the sculpture of the western façade was completed in 1190. The faces and some consoles were redone in the nineteenth century. See also Madeleine CAVINESS, *Sumptuous Arts at the Royal Abbeys in Reims and Braine*, Princeton, 1990, pp. 21–35.
- 25 CLAUSSEN, 'Zum Stil der Plastik am Dreikönigenschrein. Rezeptionen und Reflexionen', p. 35; TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*, p. 70.
- 26 TERRIER ALIFERIS 'Nicolas de Verdun à Reims: diffusion de l'art mosan et développement du style 1200'.
- 27 KASARSKA, *La sculpture de la façade de la cathédrale de Laon. Eschatologie et humanisme*.
- 28 Ibid., p. 213 *et seq.* and TERRIER ALIFERIS 'Nicolas de Verdun à Reims: diffusion de l'art mosan et développement du style 1200'.
- 29 Jean-Pierre ADAM, Simone DEYTS and Lydwine SAULNIER-PERNUIT, 'La façade des thermes de Sens', in *Revue archéologique de l'est et du centre*, 7, 1987, p. 7.
- 30 Denis CAILLEAUX, 'De la ville antique à la cité médiévale: Sens IV<sup>e</sup>–X<sup>e</sup> siècles', electronic edition, 2006.
- 31 The Sens City Museum keeps those heads from the west front that remain in good condition to enable one to assess their stylistic character.
- 32 Most recently, see the essays collected in John McNEILL and Richard PLANT (ed.), *Romanesque and the Past: Retrospection in the Art and Architecture of Romanesque Europe*, Leeds, 2013.
- 33 VITALI, 'Sicut explorator et spoliolum cupidus: Zur Methode und Funktion der Antikenrezeption bei Nicolaus von Verdun', and TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*, pp. 55–60.
- 34 PLEIN, *Die frühgotische Skulptur an der Westfassade der Kathedrale von Sens*, p. 272.
- 35 TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*, pp. 147–49.
- 36 *Horrendum caput et tamen hoc horrore decorum / Lumine terrifico terror et ipse decet*. See Jean-Yves TILLIETTE, 'Tamen horrore decorum. La statuaria antique au miroir de la littérature latine des XI<sup>e</sup> et XII<sup>e</sup> siècles', in *La littérature et les arts figurés de l'Antiquité à nos jours*, Paris, 2001, pp. 491–500.
- 37 SIGEBERT OF GEMBLoux, *Vita Deoderici*, in *Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores (in folio)*, IV, p. 478.
- 38 *Naturaliter autem hii lapides in oriente apud Coloniensem provinciam repperiuntur. Vasa formosa atque pulcherrima, cippi et scutellae aliaque utensilia quam plurima in illo tempore a antiquis ingeniose formata atque sculpta nostris temporibus reperta sunt, quae modo ab ingeniosis artificibus in auro et argento vix tam eleganter formari ac sculpi possint*. GUIBERT OF OUDENBOURG, *Tractatus de ecclesia S. Petri Aldenburgensi*, Oswald HOLDER-EGGER (ed.), in *Monumenta Germaniae historica*, XV, 2, 1888, pp. 869–71.
- 39 *In descendo montis Tarpeii Caesareae Titi laudes propriis oculis vidi, et quasi viventes coelatum marmor repraesentabat imagines, nulla temporis vetustate et moturo similis videatur*. In *Miracula s. Eadmundi, auct. Samsone abbate*, lib. 2, p. 152. Cf. Otto LEHMANN-BROCKHAUS, *Lateinische Schriftquellen zur Kunst: England, Wales und Schottland vom Jahre 901 bis zum Jahre 1307*, Munich, 1956, no 6696, p. 422.
- 40 [...] *ut insipientibus mugituro et moturo similis videatur*. Magister Gregorius, *Narracio de mirabiliis urbis Romae*, Robert B. C. HUYGENS (ed.), Leyden, 1970, § 3.
- 41 [...] *imago ex Pario marmore tam miro et inexplicabili perfecta est artificio ut magis viva creatura videatur quam statua*. MAGISTER GREGORIUS, *Narracio de mirabiliis urbis Romae*, § 12.
- 42 'Or avoit ailleurs en le chité une autre merveille. Il avoit deus ymages jetés de coivre en forme de femme, si bien faites et si natureument et i beles que trop; si n'i avoit chelui n'ait bien vint piés de haut'. Robert DE CLARI, *La conquête de Constantinople*, Jean DUFURNET (ed.), Paris, 2004, p. 180.
- 43 OVIDE, *Metamorphoses*, X; PLATON, *Ménon*, 97d. See David FREEDBERG, *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response*, Chicago, 1989, pp. 50, 51.
- 44 Baudri DE BOURGUEIL, *Poèmes*, 2, edition and translation by Jean-Yves TILLIETTE, Paris, 2002, *Adelae Comitissae*, pp. 1–42: *Opus est quod vivere credas*, v. 97; *Omnia sic videas ut quasi vera putes*, v. 130; *Veras crediderim vivasque fuisse figuras*, v. 563; *Ut maris esset opus quod fluitare putes*, v. 734; *Gurgitibus propriis pisces innare putares, Sique forent pisces, prendere posse manu*, v. 739–40.
- 45 On the 'romans d'Antiquité', see Aimé PETIT, *Naissances du roman. Les techniques littéraires dans les romans antiques du XI<sup>e</sup> siècle*, Paris–Geneva, 1985.
- 46 *Tristan et Iseut. Les poèmes français, la saga narroise*, Daniel LACROIX and Philippe WALTER (ed.), Paris, 1989, pp. 602–11.
- 47 *Le Roman de Partonopeu de Blois*, Olivier COLLET and Jean-Marie JORIS (ed.), Paris, 2005, p. 133, v. 844 ('Et ymages d'autre figure/ Qui samblent vives par nature').
- 48 BENOÎT DE SAINTE-MAURE, *Le Roman de Troie*, Emmanuel BAUMGARTNER and Françoise VIELLIARD (ed.), Paris, 1998, p. 313, v. 14673–80 ('Les dous [ymages] esteint [...] en tel maniere formees,/ Quis esgardoit, ce li ert vis/ Qu'angel fussent de Paredis') and p. 511, v. 22471–72 ('Ja home l'image n'esgardast,/ Ne li fust vis qu'ele plorast').
- 49 ALEXANDRE DE PARIS, *Le Roman d'Alexandre*, translation Laurence HARF-LANCNER, Paris, 1994, p. 699, v. 7151–52 ('C'estoit avis a ciaux qui bien les esgardoient/ Que fust chose vivant la peinture qu'il voient').

- 50 On the Twelfth-Century Renaissance, see Charles Homer HASKINS, *The Renaissance of the twelfth century*, Cambridge, Mass., 1927; William A. NITZE, 'The so-called Twelfth-Century Renaissance', in *Speculum*, 23, 1948, pp. 464–71; Eva Matthews SANFORD, 'The Twelfth Century – Renaissance or Proto-Renaissance?', in *Speculum*, 26, 1951, pp. 635–42, 1951; Christopher BROOKE, *The Twelfth Century Renaissance*, London, 1969; Jacques VERGER, *La Renaissance du XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle*, Paris, 1996.
- 51 For *enargeai* – the bringing to life of the statues – during the antique and modern periods (from the sixteenth century), see FREEDBERG, *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response*, and Caroline VAN ECK, *Art, Agency and Living Presence. From the Animated Image to the Excessive Object*, Leyden, 2015.
- 52 Laurence TERRIER ALIFERIS, 'Les sculptures de l'Eglise et de la Synagogue de Strasbourg: réflexions sur la connaissance de l'art antique du maître du transept sud de la cathédrale', in *Cahiers alsaciens d'archéologie, d'art et d'histoire*, 2010, 53, pp. 95–107 and TERRIER ALIFERIS, *L'imitation de l'Antiquité dans l'art médiéval (1180–1230)*, pp. 112–18.
- 53 Baldric of Dol, *Carmen 134 Adelaë Comitissae*; v. 951–51, 967: large statues of Philosophy and Liberal Arts decorate the chamber of the Countess Adele, carved in ivory. However, as Jean-Yves Tilliette rightly pointed out, ivory is only suitable for making small statuettes; here one must emphasize the richness of the materials used, ivory being more worthy than stone. Jean-Yves TILLIETTE, 'La chambre de la comtesse Adèle. Savoir scientifique et technique littéraire dans le C. CXCVI de Baudri de Bourgueil', in *Romania*, 102, 1981, pp. 145–71, especially p. 148. In the Roman Eneas, (around 1160), the description of Camille's tomb refers to the wealth of materials used increasingly noble from the bottom up. The base is made of stone lions while gold and gems are placed at the top (*Le Roman d'Eneas*, edition and translation Aimé PETIT, Paris, 1997, v. 7599–7784).
- 54 TERRIER ALIFERIS, 'Les sculptures de l'Eglise et de la Synagogue de Strasbourg: réflexions sur la connaissance de l'art antique du maître du transept sud de la cathédrale'.
- 55 According to my research, the last appearance of the statue-columns is at Le Mans, Notre-Dame-de-la-Couture, shortly after 1250.



